

Comparison of Potential Paddling Locations in Mission Bay Park

Prepared by the volunteers of FIDO as a public service and to
aid in resolving use conflicts in the Fiesta Island
General Development Plan process
December 14, 2008



Conflict

- Paddlers have selected a location that displaces over 6,000 existing users on the southwest shore of Fiesta Island in the off-leash exercise area
- Proposed plan jeopardizes the city's last open natural park in Mission Bay¹
- Existing users have already compromised on
 - 30% loss of off-leash access around the island (those users will now have to use the fenced off-leash area),
 - reduced access to the southwest shore (and increased conflicts),
 - a road and parking lot in natural park area.
- Exorbitant cost to modify area and add infrastructure, e.g., bathrooms (sewer, water & electricity), parking lot, road, build up beach out of tidal zone, etc.

¹ "Fiesta Island should be a place where city residents and visitors alike find the ultimate refuge from urban congestion, noise and visual clutter." Mission Bay Master Plan 1994

Existing and Alternative Site Map

- Existing Paddler Sites
- Alternative Sites



Existing Paddle Boat Locations

- It is unknown why the Outriggers and Dragon Boaters who are looking for a more optimal location cannot share with the San Diego Rowing Club or Mission Bay Aquatic location
 - Capacity?
 - Cost?

Location	Beach Access to Mission Bay w/in 200'	250' of beach storage	parking lot for ~100 cars	close proximity boat drop-off point	Room for Free storage bldg	Near existing bathrooms	Most direct paddle route to ocean	Calm Water (minimal adjacent motorized activity)*	Fresh water to rinse (Nice to Have)	Adjacent turf area (Nice to have)	Boats Stored at Existing Sites
Fiesta Island Youth Camp location	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No, ~4.3 miles	Yes, in cove, adjacent 5mph channel	Yes	No	On Beach: 8 Outriggers, 3 Dragon Boats on outdoor rack, Outdoor off Beach Rack Strg: 2 Dragon boats
MB Ski Club, 2606 No. Mission Bay Drive	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	No, ~3.3 miles	Mixed(1)	Yes	Yes	Ground Strg: 8 Outriggers
Campland	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No ~3.0 miles	Adjacent 5mph channel	Yes	Yes	Outdoor Rack Strg: 18 Outriggers +/- 2
San Diego Rowing Club, 1220 El Carmel Place	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Unknown	Yes	Yes, ~1.6 miles	Yes, in cove, part of Sail Bay	Yes	Yes	2 bldgs.w/Indoor & outdoor racks w/locked Strg (2)
Mission Bay Aquatic Center, 1001 Santa Clara Pt.	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Unknown	Yes	Yes, ~ 2.0 miles	Yes, in cove, adjacent 5mph channel	Yes	Yes	2 bldgs.w/Indoor rack Strg (2)

* All existing sites are adjacent to 5mph zones, but some are more protected in a cove

(1) Water conditions are mixed depending on where the paddlers enter the water

(2) Sites also have permitted public on beach boat storage nearby

Note: 28 boats w/o on beach storage, excluding those stored in buildings at the SD Rowing Club and MB Aquatic Center



Alternative Sites

- Ranked by location having the most existing items that meet the Paddler's requirements and most cost effective while minimizing conflicts
1. **Mariners Basin (9 yes; 1 No)**
 2. **South Shores (9 yes; 1 No)**
 3. North Cove - Vacation Isle (7 Yes; 3 No)
 4. South Cove - Vacation Isle (6 Yes; 4 No) *drain pipe in cove, requires construction of pier to cover pipe
 5. Fiesta Island's Southwest Shore (1 Yes; 9 No)

Mariner's Basin and South Shore clearly come closer to meeting criteria set by Paddlers

Location	Beach Access to Mission Bay w/in 200'	250' of beach storage	parking lot for ~100 cars	close proximity boat drop-off point	Existing Storage Bldg (1)	Near existing bathrooms	Most direct paddle route to ocean	Calm Water (minimal adjacent motorized activity) (2)	Fresh water to rinse (Nice to Have)	Adjacent turf area (Nice to have)
Mariner's Basin	Yes	Yes (Over 500')	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes, direct access ~.7 miles	Yes, in cove, adjacent 5mph channel	Yes	Yes
South Shores	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes, ~2.2 miles	Yes, in cove, adjacent 5mph channel	Yes	Yes
Vacation Isle North Cove	Yes	Yes (Over 500')	No, ~ 50 spaces (large lot nearby)	Yes	No	Yes	Yes ~1.7 miles	Yes, in cove, adjacent 5mph channel	Yes	No
Vacation Isle South Cove	No	No, Current beach is in tidal zone*	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes ~ 1.1 miles	Yes, in cove, adjacent 5mph channel	Yes	Yes
Southwest Beach on Fiesta Island	No	No, Current beach is in tidal zone*	No	No	No	No	Yes ~1.9 miles	No, located in 5mph channel	No	No



* Beach must be built above tidal zone with non-native sand (1) All sites have room for storage building
 (2) Majority of alternative sites are adjacent to 5mph zones & located in a more protected cove, except for Southwest beach on FI

List of Modifications Required For Each Site to Accommodate Paddler's Request

Location	Beach Access to Mission Bay w/in 200'	250' X 60' of beach storage	Close Proximity Parking Lot Installation	Storage Bldg	Method to secure boats on beach	Bathroom Facilities
Mariner's Basin	Exists	Exists	Exists	* Prep pad * build bldg	Required	Exists
South Shores	Exists	Exists	Exists	* Prep pad * build bldg	Required	Exists
Vacation Isle North Cove	* Major grading to lessen slope where boats would be launched * Sand to add launch area from pkg. lot	Exists	Exists	* Prep pad * build bldg	Required	Exists
Vacation Isle South Cove	* Major grading to lessen slope where boats would be launched	* Major grading * Tons of sand to bld beach up out of tidal zone * Bld. Pier to cover drain pipe	Exists	* Prep pad * build bldg	Required	Exists
Southwest Beach on Fiesta Island	* Major grading of southwest berm	* Major grading * Tons of sand to bld beach up out of tidal zone	* Install Prkg lot * Install road to prkg lot	* Prep pad * build bldg	Required	No - needs to be installed



Expensive



Exists or relatively low cost

Alternative Sites: Additional Benefit Comparative

Location	Existing Large Parking Lots in Close Proximity	Close proximity to Hotels & Tourist Services for Paddle Events	Adjacent control of water turbulence near boat launch	Cost Effective	Obstacles in Cove	Conflict
Mariner's Basin	Yes	Near numerous hotels & services	Yes, adjacent to 5 mph channel	Yes, requires minimal modifications	Boats moored in center near the south end, plenty of room for paddlers & events	None known of
South Shores	Yes	Near Hilton Mission Bay	Yes, adjacent to 5 mph channel	Yes, requires moderate modifications	None (opposite side of cove has boat ramp, speeds are slower than 5 mph)	None known of
Vacation Isle North Cove	No, ~ 50 space pkg lot w/larger lots nearby	Direct access to Paradise Point Hotel, MB Services nearby	Yes, adjacent to 5 mph channel	Needs to be determined, Requires significant grading to improve boat launching	None	None known of
Vacation Isle South Cove	Yes	Direct access to Paradise Point Hotel, MB Services nearby	Yes, adjacent to 5 mph channel	No, Requires Major grading and beach installation	Drainage pipe in cove, should be covered by pier for better aesthetics & safety	None known of
Southwest Beach on Fiesta Island	No, must be built	Near Hilton Mission Bay	No, located in 5 mph channel, possible turbulence from Skiers when present, but minimal	No, Most Expensive - requires Major grading, installation of beach, sewer, electrical, road, parking & fresh water, etc.	N/A	Major Conflict w/Existing Users who use the area 365 days/year

Conclusion

- Mariner's Basin and South Shore are clearly better alternative sites according to criteria set by Paddlers
- Other sites would greatly reduce cost to the public (City) and likely allow paddlers to secure a location faster than on Fiesta Island
- If an LCP amendment is required to establish an additional location for on-beach storage of paddle boats, FIDO is willing to prepare it and discuss what would be required to get it processed.
- FIDO remains committed to helping the paddlers establish a site that does not conflict with our use.

Summary of Issues

- Find suitable and economically feasible site for paddle groups who are in less than desirable locations*
- **Paddler's Requirements (Source: The Outrigger club's information gathering meeting- Fiesta Island GDP-Minutes with KTU+A, October 4, 2006)**
 - Direct access to Mission Bay within 200 ft. of shoreline
 - Open beach storage for approx. 50 canoes 250 ft. length X 60 ft. depth total area
 - Small equipment storage (paddles, flotation vests, etc.) approx. 10 ft. X15 ft. X 5 ft.
 - Parking for approx. 100 cars in close proximity
 - The most direct paddling route to the ocean
 - Minimal motorized activity adjacent to the area
 - Close proximity to restrooms
 - Fresh water rinse capability (beneficial not required)
 - Adjacent turf area (beneficial not required)
- **Public/City needs**
 - Minimize overall cost of new improvements for Plans
 - Minimize conflicts with other uses
 - Maximize shoreline access/uses for all uses

* A paddler representative testified at the 9/11/2007 meeting of the Mission Bay Park Committee that they had created a "matrix of paddling sites" showing the various needs and facilities for their use throughout Mission Bay and claiming that the site along the southwestern shore of Fiesta Island was the best by far. In spite of requests from FIDO and various City offices, they have never produced that matrix. As a final resort, FIDO volunteers have prepared such a matrix. We have evaluated other large, underutilized beach locations using a variety of parameters.

